Rhetoric and urbanism:
foundational speeches, deliberation and scenarios
of space engagement

Justin Snell

The notion of isonomy created for sixth century Athens by a
man like Cleisthenes, is a truly structural conception by
which the centre alone is privileged. Since all the citizens
have relations with it which at the same time are symmetrical
and reversible. At this period the conception of the city was
exclusively a signifying one.
Roland Barthes

In 1967 Barthes addressed a colloquium at the University of
Naples under the title of Sémiologie et Urbanisme. Propelled by the double
amour of ‘signs and cities’ he sought, with precautions, to open the
‘possibility of a semiotics of the city’. In the same year civic unrest and
the rise of black militancy in America signalled further resistance to
segregation, discrimination, police brutality and economic inequality, and
heralded the political and rhetorical power of the mobilisation of mass
action. In South Africa, as medals were being stamped to solemnify the
assassination of President Verwoed the previous year in 1966, existing
Apartheid legislation around population registration, racial segregation
and control of black labour was re-codified. Significantly, a new law was
instituted in the growing war against the urban unrest and the African
National Congress’ armed liberation struggle. The Terrorism Act (General
Laws Amendment Act No 83) of 1967 in which that ‘designed to combat
terrorism itself became an instrument of terror’ resulted in the many of
the atrocities, instances of torture and deaths in detention committed
under Apartheid.

Barthes’ address covered a host of topics, analyses and
representations from Herodotean cartography and Cleisthenes’ ‘isonomy’

---

1 Barthes’ Sémiologie et Urbanisme was first published in 1967 in L’Architecture d’aujourd’hui and
the extensive literature on the topic see, Claval, Paul “Geographie et sémiologie” in Espace
géographique 1974 Volume 3 No. 2 pp. 113-119. Barthes’ urban semiotics appears to bear
affinities with his analysis three years later of Balzac’s Sarazine, S/Z where analogously codes
create a spatial topos or network.
to Hugo’s *Notre Dame de Paris*, Levi Strauss’ *Triste Tropiques* and contemporary theoretical works such as Lynch’s *The Image of the City*. Through propositions like ‘human space in general (not only urban space) has always been a signifying space’ and ‘the city as a writing’, it would seem the city would ultimately reveal its deep [tropic] structures and yield to becoming a readable and legible signifying entity. While an analysis of the semiotic project in relation to hermeneutics, phenomenology and urbanism is beyond the scope of this paper, the city as a symbolic form is, as evidenced in the scope of his references, an idea of extreme antiquity. While an analysis of the semiotic project in relation to he his references, an idea of extreme antiquity. What concerns us here is rather an omission or lacuna. On the fiftieth anniversary of Barthes’ address it is perhaps instructive to enquire what his view on *isonomia* and form of questioning would have been, had the colloquium been held after ‘the [re]turn to Rhetoric’.

Often rendered as ‘equality of political’ rights *isonomia* was also one of the terms used by Herodotus as ‘periphrasis for democracy’. Thus we find, “The rule of the multitude has in the first place the loveliest name of all, equality (*isonomia*), and does in the second place none of the things that a monarch does. It determines offices by lot, and holds power accountable, and conducts all deliberating publicly.” Earlier in the decade Vernant had undertaken in detailed form the same task with regards to the differentiation of sacred rulership in the *polis*, defining the *agora* as "a spatial image to express the self-awareness that a human group has acquired" noting further “those who shared in the world of the polis were *homoioi* – men who were alike, and later more abstractedly *isoi* – equals [ ] In the six century this image of the human world was precisely expressed in the concept of *isonomia* – that is the equal participation all citizens in the exercise of power”

---

With the caveat that I am neither a classicist nor a specialist in Greek thought, what appears noteworthy is the paucity of references and that in Aristotle’s sustained mediation on politics and the polis it is not mentioned at all. This apparent contradiction between the lack of attestation and its possible symbolic significance raises the question of its purpose. Here Garver’s distinction between ‘guiding and given ends’ is instructive, “Every polis, like every art and virtue, has both a given end and an internal, constitutive end.[] The guiding, internal, or constitutive end is a means to the given end”. To frame the question in these terms we may ask, was isonomy a guiding or a given end? To begin, what appears to be common to Aristotle and Herodotus is the key significance of deliberation. Alongside forensic and deliberative [political] rhetoric, epideixis understood not only as display but also as demonstration of values, is integral to institutional, ritual and political life. Although deliberative rhetoric is assigned by Aristotle to the register of future, epideixis is connected to the theme of future through its aspirational dimension. Indeed this ‘working out’ of values would seem to indicate the centrality of rhetoric and the performative dimension with respect to urban life. It also raises question of rhetoric in relation to the polis whether, in Heideggerian terms, it is not ‘a theory of practice of public speaking but as the unveiling of logos in Greek politics.’

As an interpretive vehicle, in the context of South Africa, deliberation, foundational speeches and what may be termed rhetorical

---

9 On the complexities of this issue Lombardini notes, ‘Both the exact meaning of the concept, which originated in the late sixth century BC, and its precise relationship with démokratia, however, remain unclear. [] The fact that the term is attested only twenty times in a period of nearly two hundred years exacerbates the difficulties of interpretation. Despite the scarcity of its attestation, the term isonomy appears to signal an important conceptual shift in how political regimes were evaluated in the ancient Greek world. Lombardini, J. “Isonomia and the public sphere in Democratic Athens” in HoPT, Vol. XXXIV.No. 3. Autumn 2013
11 “There is a tight verbal parallel between ordinary citizens’ entitlement to enter into that “element” of the city that “deliberates concerning the advantageous things and judges concerning the just things” (1329a2-4) Wilson, JL. “Deliberation, Democracy, and the Rule of Reason in Aristotle’s Politics”, APSR vol105, Issue 2 May 2011, pp. 259-274
12 “To praise a “city” [laus civitatis] rests on an act of persuasion aimed at political exercise itself; [] Quintilian claims that beyond the pleasure of epideictic demonstrations oratorical prowess (if one agrees with his rendering of epideictic as a show, a recital, a performance), there is, in the working of values “demonstrated” by the recital itself, a “pragmatic” force that operates on public affairs.” Salazar, P-J. An African Athens : Rhetoric and the Shaping of Democracy in South Africa, (New Jersey, London, 2002), p. 132.
13 See Cassin, B. Sophistical Practice: Toward a Consistent Relativism, (Fordham University, 2014), pp. 114-135.
scenarios of space engagement have played a central role in the instauration of a new democratic political landscape. Studies on oratory an instrument of resistance during Apartheid, and then in dialogue with secular rhetoric have demonstrated the key role rhetoric exerted in the transformation-conversion to democracy. As the legacy of Apartheid segregationist policies persists, emphasis has often been placed on demonstrating how urban environments might be able to redress former injustices, whilst solving urban and social problems.\textsuperscript{15} Alongside urgent concerns of housing, land restitution and equitable access to resources, “public space” has emerged as a central focus. Of key importance has been attempting to understand the deep structural continuities and challenges arising from policies and planning implemented under Apartheid.\textsuperscript{16}

Derived from Dutch dual etymon signifying ‘apart-ness’ or the ‘state of being separate’ Apartheid became the universally derided epitome and synonym for racism described by Derrida as \textit{La Dernier Mot}.\textsuperscript{17} The a-history of Derrida’s rendering was contested by McClintock and Nixon who note that, inaugurated by General Smuts in 1917, usage of the term thus pre-dates the regime as indeed did the legislation that preceded it.\textsuperscript{18} After 1948, Apartheid became indelibly linked with the policies, racist ideology and segregationist planning of the National Party. Extant principles of colonial segregation and labour laws were inaugurated and codified into the extensive apparatus of Apartheid legislation. Building on Colonial laws such as the \textit{Natives Land Act} of 1913, the \textit{Group Areas Act} promulgated in 1950 effected separation whilst restricting tenure and habitation on the basis of race.\textsuperscript{19} The origins of Afrikaner attitudes towards place and race have traditionally been ascribed to an isolationist ‘frontier tradition’, forged in combination with a legacy of religious persecution and steeped in Calvinist theology.\textsuperscript{20}

\textsuperscript{15}From the extensive body of literature see Dewar & Uytenbogaardt, \textit{South African Cities: A Manifesto for Change}: Urban Problems Research Unit, UCT, 1991, and Southworth, B. "City Squares in Cape Town’s Townships-Public Space as an Instrument of Urban Transformation: CoCT UD, \, www.treasury.gov.za
\textsuperscript{16}Morris, M. “Continuity or Rupture: The City, Post-Apartheid” in \textit{Social Research}, Vol. 65, No. 4 (WINTER 1998), pp. 759-775 Published by The New School
By the early twentieth century, alongside ideas such as the rejection of *gelykstelling* (equalisation with 'Blacks'), neo-Calvinist and nationalist ideals notions had been fused with Chosen People rhetoric to lay the groundwork for an emerging Afrikaner National identity. Under the aegis of the reformed Afrikaner Church (*Gereformeerde Kerk*), revisionist Afrikaner history and theology was reconstituted in ‘Dr Verwoerd’s ideological vision of an apartheid order as the divine mission of Afrikanerdom’. In Verwoed we are able to discern the role played by rhetoric and foundational speeches in dialogue with segregationist policies and spatial strategies. While his dissertation on Apartheid in 1948 brought of the *Minister of Native Affairs* to prominence, it was in his immediate response to Macmillan's “Winds of Change” speech in Parliament and subsequent strategizing as President that his political and rhetorical abilities came to the fore. To divert growing international rejection and disavowal of *Apartheid*, Verwoed effected the rhetorical mutation of MacMillian’s ‘National Consciousness’, into ‘Separate Development’.

Rendered as the ‘tendency in Africa for nations to become independent’, the *homelands* and *bantustans* of Verwoed's Separate Development were predicated on a pretense of 'self-determination' and born of a fear of degeneracy from 'intermingling' [*bloedvergmening*] and ‘Out-Breeding’ [*Uitbastering*]. Arising primarily, it was believed, from spatial proximity and collective co-habitation, Verwoed wrote, “Mixed living is one of the prime social causes of blood-mixing. Whites in mixed areas lose their ties with the volk. Unconsciously a gradual process of feeling equal (*gelykvoeling*) [with nonwhites] begins to take place in them.”

Although he disavowed any relationship with National Socialism, the contradictory relationship is clearly embodied in the character, rhetoric and anti-semitic policies of Verwoed’s performative leadership.

---

21 Ibid. P. 951
23 McClintock & Nixon note, "References in the official discourse of the regime to the inferiority of blacks to whites started to be phased out, and the country was no longer referred to as "multiracial" (which would imply a single political entity) but as "multinational." Op cit. p. 142
24 That is why we adopt the policy that the Bantu, wherever he may live in various areas of his own, must be given political control and domination or dominion over his own areas and people. Just as the Italians in France retain their vote in Italy, so the Bantu, who are living temporarily in our urban areas, must have a say in their homelands." Verwoed, H.F. Speech on the policy of separate development, (April 14, 1961).
thematics of ‘Blut und Boden’ as persuasion directed at re-founding society through biology-social engineering whilst maintaining recourse to the land as repository of values can be noted as background.26

Analogously the Apartheid state and urban landscape was mapped, drawn-up and configured in accordance with patterns of racial homogeneity requiring physical and cultural separation. The evolution of this spatial planning model has been located within the context of the growth of South African cities, proposed as the product of three paradigms: earlier colonial or Bastidal, Later Colonial, and finally Modern Town-planning.27 Within the latter, the following have bearing: The Garden City Movement predicated on separation of living and working allied to ‘Neighbourhood’ social theories, land-use control and zoning; functionalist and reductionist tabula rasa style planning; and finally mobility, movement and the ascendency of vehicular or traffic oriented planning models. Of key import is the influence of Le Corbusier’s utopian vision codified at the Congrès International d’ArchitectureModerne (CIAM) as ‘The Functional City’ from the Athens Charter.28 La Ville Radieuse, designed to alleviate problems of urban pollution and overcrowding often involved totalizing planning solutions for the large-scale demolition of towns cities replaced with super-blocks.

Le Corbusier’s ‘radiant’ urban planning, despite polemics to the contrary, has been shown to be indebted to Renaissance models he consciously eschewed. Carl notes, ‘it is Vignola who first recognizes the possibilities of a conception of architectural ordering which is fundamental to Le Corbusier: the reciprocity of architectural fragments and a structured landscape.”29 In the late-Renaissance within the context of the Counter-Reformation and mobilisation of the confraternities, epideictic oratory deployed to expound upon the moral reform of the city becomes allied to what might be termed the perspectivisation or ‘optical transformation’ of urban phenomena.30 These developments constitute the deeper background to the evolution of surveillance and the forms of

30 “It becomes possible to regard city and garden as aspects of a single representational continuum mediated by rhetoric and perspective.” Ibid. p51. See also Guest, C.L. Figural Cities: Bruni’s Laudatio Urbis Florentinae and its Greek Sources in Rhetoric, Theatre and the Arts of Design, (Oslo, Novus, 2008).
scopic and social control one finds in Modernism. The notion of ‘Separate Development’ as ideological fragments within the structured field of the Apartheid political landscape, may be understood as both as a rhetorical scenario of space engagement and example of the ‘dramatic’ possibilities of ‘picturing’ culture.

Through *Le Group Transvaal*, in the 1930’s modernism began to influence architecture and planning in South Africa. Pearse and Hanson created the programmatic elements of ‘township’ underscored by reductionist and functionalist models allied to rhetorical tropes such as ‘community’ whilst ‘efficiency’ one of the key tenets of Modernism, became a watchword. Under the aegis of South African architects and planners, modernist rhetoric and principles was welded to Apartheid ideology to forge a model or spatial planning paradigm for the enforcement of segregationist legislation. Key rhetorical tropes such as ‘separation living and working’ and ‘land-use and zoning’ underpinned the foundation of new segregated urban settlements and the re-configuration of existing towns and cities. Often requiring demolition and ‘forced removals’, townships were established for different race groups removed from cities whilst arterial roads were used for transport, policing and surveillance. ‘Buffer zones’ [taking a variety of forms from roads to natural landscapes to golf courses] were deployed to effect segregation of neighbourhoods along racial lines.

In 1955, the same year the *Group Areas Development Act*, South Africa’s defining moment of civil resistance and founding of its future democracy took place - the *Congress of the People*. On an open piece of land in Kliptown, Johannesburg delegates from diverse backgrounds and cultures debated and contributed to the creation of a unified common vision - the *Freedom Charter* inaugurating the Declaration of the Human Rights for South Africa. The Congress followed a traditional form of protest and rhetoric - a body of citizens assembled to create through deliberation the template of democracy, a Charter. In 1964 in *The Speech from the Dock* Mandela invoked the Freedom Charter and its origins:

---

The basic task at the present moment is the removal of race discrimination and the attainment of democratic rights on the basis of the Freedom Charter. The Magna Carta, the Petition of Rights, the Bill of Rights are documents which are held in veneration by democrats throughout the world. I have great respect for British political institutions, and for the country's system of justice. I regard the British Parliament as the most democratic institution in the world, and the independence and impartiality of its judiciary never fail to arouse my admiration.35

As background to the task that faced Mandela, we may invoke Kant's On The Moral Law, in particular the two sections on the 'Motive of Duty [The Formal Principle of Duty and Reverence for the Law] which immediately prece 'The Categorial Imperative'. Here Kant articulates two potentially contradictory dimensions of aspects of the question of duty: firstly where the 'moral worth' of an action resides not in ‘the purpose attained by but in the maxim according which it is decided upon’ and secondly ‘that duty is the necessity to act out of reverence for the Law’.36 For Mandela as a ‘man of the law’, the question was how to engage with, and act out of reverence, for South Africa and its laws, whilst at same time being obeying his own convictions and conscience.37 Mandela’s rhetorical strategy at the Rivonia Trial, where “We were faced with this conflict between the law and our conscience” was both in dialogue with, and the counterpart to, the Congress of the People. Reflecting on the Charter itself Mandela uses conscience and reverence to create a space of reflection in which the mirror of democracy was held up to South Africa.

Derrida notes, “There is no law without mirror. And in this properly reversible structure, we will never avoid the moment of admiration.”38 Mandela’s speech also addresses the question of future. Derrida continues, ‘We will never stop admiring him, him and his

35Nelson Mandela “Statement from the dock”, The Rivonia Trial, Palace of Justice, Pretoria Supreme Court, Pretoria South Africa, Monday, April 20, 1964
37Agozino notes analogously that Mandela was “convicted in 1964 before being sentenced to a life in prison just as Martin Luther King Jr was penning his famous letter from Birmingham City Jail in which he proclaimed that disobedience to unjust laws is an obedience to God” Agozino, B. “The Criminology of Madiba Mandela: A Tribute” in African Journal of Criminology and Justice Studies: AJCJS, Vol.7, #s1 &2 November 2013 ISSN 1554-3897. P.141
admiration. But we not yet know whom to admire in him, the one who, in
the past, will have been captive of his admiration or the one who, in a futur
antérieur, will always have been free for having had the patience of his
admiration and having known passionately, what he had to admire. Going
so far as to refuse, again yesterday, a conditional freedom?'
Derrida’s argument around futur antérieur is that Mandela as a lawyer trained in
British law, was calling on a foundation to inaugurate what was already
there, in the Law, namely preceding the law. By recalling and invoking
the Freedom Charter, as a ‘founding’ moment, Mandela’s rhetoric drew
upon the ‘force of reflection’ to instaurate South Africa’s future
democracy.

Mandela’s "Speech from the Dock" in the manner in which it opened
up a ‘space of discourse’ could also be understood as spatial, a rhetorical
scenario engaging with the Apartheid regime and its unjust Laws, whilst
laying the foundation for the founding templates of South Africa’s future
democracy: The South African Constitution and Truth and Reconciliation
Commission [TRC].

Forty years on from the Congress in 1995, inaugurating the South African Constitutional Court Mandela address the
question of the relation between an institution and its embodiment, “It is
not just a building that we inaugurate [ ] It is an institution that we
establish.”

In 2002 a competition was held to commemorate the Congress
of the People and inauguration of the Freedom Charter. One of
the principal motifs of the winning entry was the grid representing isonomia
and symbolising equality, equal distribution, equilibrium, balance,
equality of political rights. Whilst the symbol and meaning of equality
was subsequently retained, in their report the South African Heritage
Resources Agency noted:

The use of the ancient Greek symbolism for the concept of
democracy in the design is not considered relevant to the national
identity of South Africans.

---

39Ibid. p. 85.
40 Salazar, P-J, Truth and Reconciliation in South Africa. The Fundamental Documents, with Erik
Doxtader, (Cape Town, 2008) cited in Cassin, B. “Enough of the Truth For” - On the Truth
41 Speech by President Nelson Mandela at the inauguration of the Constitutional Court, 14
February 1995, Johannesburg
42 Isonomia was first communicated to me by Professor Dalibor Vesely in 1998. cf “Walter
Sisulu Square-the winner's design” http://www.jda.org.za/
43 Nobel notes,’ Criticism of the reliance upon ‘Greek symbolism’, was presumably made with
respect to architects competition drawings, which elaborates upon their choice of a square
grid motif for the paving of the Old and the New Square. [ ] And possibly, this criticism also
refers, in a more general sense, to the neo-classical like geometry that underpins this design.”
The rejection of *isonomia* and retention of equality as a symbolic motif, while related to the [in]appropriateness of colonial or neo-classical models, may also indicate we are in the presence of democracy’s inner workings. The performative dimension of urban life and central role of rhetoric in urban discourse creates and sustains communicative civic order and justice. Here, on the ‘amnestying of Apartheid’ we may note that the transaction between a speech-act and amnestying of vengeance is a foundational moment in the evolution of law and institutionalisation of conflict. Rather than settings, background or instruments of persuasion-social transformation, urban environments as locations for public deliberation point to the idea that it is the *agon* of debate in transaction with symbolic motifs or images which constitutes its ‘guiding end’.$^{44}$ This nexus is essential to establishing the common ground [of differences], conditions for dialogue and founding the endless task of democratic discursivity, deliberation and forgiveness.$^{45}$

~ A W Mellon-UCT Postdoctoral Fellow in Rhetoric Studies, Centre for Rhetoric Studies, University of Cape Town ~